

Staff Report and Recommendations Agenda of August 28, 2023, Item 6a

County of Ventura • Resource Management Agency

800 S. Victoria Avenue, Ventura, CA 93009-1740 • (805) 654-2478 • www.vcrma.org/divisions/planning

I. <u>APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER:</u>

Applicant/Property Owner: Martin Rojas

115 S G Street Oxnard, CA 93030

Plans Prepared By: Frank Delgado

3651 Miramar Way Oxnard, CA 93035

II. REQUEST:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) (CHO §1371) from the CHB for the construction of a 71-square-foot wood pergola over the existing concrete porch of a residence located at 115 S G Street, Oxnard, CA 93030 (Henry T. Oxnard Historic District, Ventura County Landmark #161). (Case No. CH23-0031).

III. LOCATION AND PROPERTY INFORMATION:

115 S G Street, Oxnard, CA 93030

Assessor's Parcel Number (APN): 202-0-030-400

Historic Designation: Contributor, Henry T. Oxnard Historic District, Ventura County

Landmark #161

Common/Historic Name: N/A

The subject property consists of 7,000 square feet and contains an existing 950-square-foot residence and detached one- and two-car garages of 262 square feet and 576 square feet, respectively. The residence is a single-story, Mediterranean style house built around 1926 for Irwin M. Lowe, auditor for Ventura Investment Company.¹

IV. PROJECT SCOPE:

The proposed scope of work consists of the construction of a 71-square-foot wood pergola over the existing concrete porch at the residence's primary elevation. Refer to Exhibit 1 for proposed plans and elevations, including a current photo of the residence.

V. HISTORICAL SIGNIFICANCE:

_

San Buenaventura Research Associates, Oxnard - Santa Paula Historic Resources Survey (Phase I Part II), July 1981.

CHB Staff Report – Item 6a August 28, 2023 CH23-0031 Page 2 of 6

The Henry T. Oxnard District was the first Oxnard subdivision created in 1911 and named after Henry T. Oxnard, one of the four brothers who built the sugar beet factory from which the city grew. Several early 1900s homes remain in the subdivision. There are 137 homes in the area that vary in size from 1,000 to 5,000 square feet. The district encompasses an intact collection of late Victorian, 20th Century Revivals, Prairie, and Craftsman-influenced architecture ranging from 1911 to 1950. This includes large Craftsman bungalows and various Revival-style smaller homes. The district is roughly bounded by Fifth Street and Magnolia Avenue in the City of Oxnard, and stretches from an alley between E and F Streets to the east and an alley between G and H Streets to the west.

The subject residence is a single-story, Mediterranean style house built around 1926 for Irwin M. Lowe, auditor for Ventura Investment Company. Known alterations to the property include replacement of windows, smooth stucco exterior finish, and the concrete front porch, and the addition of a wrought iron railing to the front porch area and a Craftsman style front door. The original one-car garage remains intact and is a simple, stucco'ed, flat-roofed rectangular structure that is accessed from the front driveway. The two-car detached garage was constructed in 2013 in keeping with the architectural style of the main residence and authorized by the Cultural Heritage Board. Refer to Figure 1 and Figure 2 below for historical views of the subject residence.

Common character-defining features of the Mediterranean style consist of low-pitched hipped roofs, red clay tile roofs, stucco exteriors (either smooth or rough texture), carved brackets, arcaded porches and arched door and window openings, commonly infilled with wrought iron grilles. Exterior ornamentation and details may include stone elements, balconies, carved doors, and raw iron and metalwork.





Figure 2 – View of 115 S G Street in 2012



VI. CULTURAL HERITAGE ORDINANCE ANALYSIS:

The scope of work proposed at the subject District Contributor requires a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) from the CHB. Ventura County Cultural Heritage Ordinance (CHO) §1371-4 provides that the CHB use the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties with Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings ("Secretary's Standards") in its evaluation of the property and the proposed scope of work. CHB staff determined the standards for rehabilitation are appropriate for this request and evaluated the proposed exterior scope of work against the relevant standards below. Pursuant to CHO §1371-4(a), using the Secretary's Standards as a guide, the CHB shall approve the COA if it can be found that the proposed work will neither reduce the significant architectural features nor reduce the character of historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value of the site.

Standards

#9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Staff Comments

Differentiation: CHB staff considers the proposed pergola design and materials to be different enough so as to be recognizable as new construction. The proposed design would be wood construction while the existing house contains stucco and tile elements.

Compatibility: The height, scale and massing of adjacent buildings should dictate the height, scale and massing of new construction in the Historic District. The proposed pergola appears to be compatible with the height, scale, and massing of the residence and would be subordinate to the existing roof profile. Therefore, the proposed construction would not detract from the building's ability to convey its significance as a contributor to the eligible district.

Based on the above considerations, CHB staff determined the scope of work is consistent with this Standard.

#10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Integrity is defined as the ability of a property to convey its historical significance, or the authenticity of a property's historic identity, evidenced by the survival of physical characteristics and materials that existed during the property's historic or prehistoric period of significance. A property would typically possess several (although not necessarily all) of the following seven aspects of integrity, as defined in National Register Bulletin 15, to convey

Standards	Staff Comments
	its significance: Location, Design, Setting, Materials, Workmanship, Feeling, and Association. ³
	It appears that if new construction were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property would be unimpaired.
	Based on the above considerations, CHB staff determined the scope of work is consistent with this Standard.

VII. STAFF CONCLUSION:

Based on the above considerations, the proposed scope of work appears consistent with the Secretary's Standards. The project site is within the Henry T. Oxnard Historic District and is designated as County Landmark No. 161. Except for the above-mentioned alterations, the existing residence and one-car garage maintain their overall historic integrity. The proposed project appears sufficiently differentiated, yet compatible with the existing residence in terms of materials, height, scale, and massing. Thus, the proposed project would not appear to detract from the building's ability to convey its significance as a contributor to the designated district.

Based on the above, CHB staff recommends the CHB adopt the following recommendation related to the scope of work in order to better conform to the Secretary's Standards:

• Recommendation #1: Repair. Any disturbed areas of the main residence should be patched and repaired in conformance with the Secretary's Standards and Guidelines.

VIII. PUBLIC COMMENTS:

No public comment regarding this item has been received to date.

IX. RECOMMENDED ACTIONS:

CHB staff recommends the CHB take the following actions regarding the request:

Ventura County Ordinance Code, Article 5 of Chapter 3 of Division 1, Section 1363.

CHB Staff Report – Item 6a August 28, 2023 CH23-0031 Page 6 of 6

- 1. **CONDUCT** public hearing, **RECEIVE** oral and written testimony, and **CONSIDER** the Planning Division Staff report and all exhibits and attachments hereto;
- 2. **FIND** whether the proposed project meets the requirements of the Ventura County Cultural Heritage Ordinance Section 1371-4(a); and
- 3. If the requisite finding can be made based on the preceding evidence and analysis, **APPROVE** the Certificate of Appropriateness (Cultural Heritage Ordinance [CHO] §1371) with any Cultural Heritage Board or staff recommendations determined necessary to better conform to the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards*.

Prepared by:

Reviewed by:

Dillan Murray, Associate Planner Ventura County Planning Division (805) 654-5042

Tricia Maier, Manager Planning Programs Section (805) 654-2464

Exhibits:

Exhibit 1: Proposed Plans and Elevations